Reviewer's report

Title: Risk and Prognostic Significance of Tuberculosis in patients from The TREAT Asia HIV Observational Database

Version: 1 Date: 21 October 2008

Reviewer: Giovanni Rezza

Reviewer's report:

This is a rather interesting paper on HIV/TB coinfection. As expected, the risk of developing TB was associated with increasing immunosuppression and partly reduced by HAART. In general, patients with TB tended to have a better prognosis than those with other ADI. Although the article is quite clear, there are several points that need to be clarified. Firstly, the conclusions, as reported in the abstract, are not clear (what's the meaning of 'overall prognosis of developing TB...?'). Secondly, the numbers in the text are sometimes confusing: Overall, 3516 patients were recruited, but only 3279 had one follow-up visit; 717 patients had TB at recruitment, but were enrolled in the study any way: thus, the sentence in the methods section affirming that 'Only first diagnoses of TB during follow-up were included' is valid also for those who already had a 'first' TB diagnosis at recruitment. This should be better specified. Thirdly, the last paragraph in page 7 (results) should be moved to the 'methods' section. Moreover, the last sentence in page 9 is confusing and should be totally rewritten. Finally, some editing is needed (i.e., HAART and ART are use sometimes interchangeably, etc.). Yet, HAART was given when 'clinically indicated': please, specify.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.