Reviewer's report

Title: Risk and Prognostic Significance of Tuberculosis in patients from The TREAT Asia HIV Observational Database

Version: 1 Date: 20 October 2008

Reviewer: Ekaterina Kourbatova

Reviewer's report:

General comments

This paper reports study of risk factors associated with TB diagnosis and significance of TB disease diagnosis in overall survival in patients with HIV based on large TAHOD database including patients from 17 sites in the Asia-Pacific region. The study has well-defined aims; methodology is appropriate, and is well described; results are clearly presented and relate to the study objectives; the Discussion covers the main issues raised by the results, and the study limitations are clearly stated.

Taking into consideration that the data are solid and analysis is scientifically sound, the article can serve as evidence for further studies, and all suggestions are minor, I recommend this article for publishing.

Minor Essential Revisions

1. Please state in Methods start and end dates of follow up for cohort of patients included in analysis.
2. Methods, page 5, 1st paragraph. Please provide clear definition of “prior TB diagnosis”.
3. In last paragraph in Methods, page 6 it is stated that final multivariate model included ONLY covariates significant at .05 level, however next sentence tells that non-significant variables were also presented. Please remove word “only”.
4. Results, 2nd paragraph. The way findings summarized in text is different from presentation in table 1 which is confusing. Please either change text to correspond results in table 1 (“Patients with prior TB were less likely to be female, report HIV infection through homosexual contact (compared to heterosexual contact)…..”) or change reference groups in table 1 to correspond results in text.
5. Please move last paragraph on page 7 to Methods.
6. Results, page 8, second paragraph, line 14. Please check p value for adjusted HR (according table 2 should be p=.005).

Discretionary Revisions

1. In Results, page 7, first paragraph please provide clear denominators for 3rd
sentence, i.e. “at entry to TAHOD 759 (22%) of 3,516 patients, …. 717 (22%) of 3,279”.

2. Table 1. I advice to either provide additional column for patients without TB or replace column with total number of patients with column for patients without TB.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.