Reviewer's report

Title: Ertapenem versus piperacillin/tazobactam for the treatment of complicated infections: a meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials

Version: 5 Date: 12 August 2009

Reviewer: Raffaele Pezzilli

Reviewer's report:

I believe that all meta-analytic studies on the use of antibiotic treatment in acute pancreatitis suffer of limitations; these limitations were inherent in the primary study design such as inclusion criteria, duration and dosing of antibiotics, assessment of severity of disease, nutritional support, and resuscitative measures, and finally in the relatively small number of patients in each individual study.

In conclusion, we do not need more meta-analytic studies on this topic; on the contrary, additional and well-carried out studies are required to explore the benefits of antibiotic prophylaxis in severe acute pancreatitis, also taking into account the adverse effects, the effects of the varying duration of the therapy, and whether the outcome of the infection is related to the etiology.

I thank the authors for their efforts in re-evaluating their manuscript, but my judgement remains negative. However, the final decision to accept the manuscript remains of the Editor-in-Chief.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests