Reviewer’s report

Title: The association of RANTES polymorphism with severe acute respiratory syndrome in Hong Kong and Beijing Chinese

Version: 1 Date: 23 March 2007

Reviewer: Carolina Scagnolari

Reviewer’s report:

General
The authors examined whether polymorphism of RANTES, IP-10 and Mig affect the susceptibility to the infection with SARS virus and outcome of the disease. Specifically their results show that RANTES-28G allele is associated with SARS susceptibility in Hong Kong Chinese subjects.

The results are interesting and could be important from the applicative point of view but the manuscript requires a substantial revision.

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
- Authors should explain how patients were clinically diagnosed as having SARS;
- Authors should indicate in detail statistical analysis performed to analyze the difference between Hong Kong Chinese patients with SARS and healthy Red Cross blood donors;
- Does the study include SARS patients suffering from co-morbidities (such as diabetes mellitus, hypertension, heart diseases, tuberculosis, asthma, and malignancy)? If so, how many?

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
- The data describing the demographic characteristics of SARS patients would benefit from presentation in table format;
- The abbreviations CLEC4M, OAS-1 and MxA on page 6 line 8 should be explained;
- The result 0 (0%) of Mig nt367 on table 2 page 25 should be written 0 (0);
- The results on table 2-6 would benefit from presentation in the same style

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

None

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests