Reviewer's report

Title: Suitability of vaccinia virus and bovine viral diarrhea virus (BVDV) to determine activity against enveloped viruses of three commonly used alcohol-based hand rubs

Version: 1 Date: 13 September 2006

Reviewer: Andreas Sauerbrei

Reviewer's report:

General comments:
The authors present an extensively revised manuscript. That is why the paper can be recommended for publication now. However, the authors have to consider some minor amendments before the manuscript will be published.

Specific comments:
Page 4, paragraph 2, last sentence. The authors stated that the alcohol-based hand rubs were tested against “four other enveloped viruses which represent some of the most relevant enveloped viruses in human medicine”. This statement is not true for the avian influenza A virus which was also included in this study.
Page 5, Inactivation assay. Exposure times used in the tests should be mentioned.
Page 7, Results. The first sentence is not a result. This sentence should be added to the Method section (Test viruses).
Page 10, paragraph 2. The first sentence is a repetition (see also page 9, first sentence).
Table 1. The size should be reduced. Reduction factors after exposure of 15 sec must be mentioned. However, the equal values after 30 and 60 sec are not necessary. In addition, the composition of the hand rubs A, B and C should be mentioned as footnote.
All abbreviations must be elucidated and also used in the entire manuscript.