Author's response to reviews

Title: Suitability of vaccinia virus and bovine viral diarrhea virus (BVDV) for determining activities of three commonly-used alcohol-based hand rubs against enveloped viruses

Authors:

Gunter Kampf (guenter.kampf@bode-chemie.de)
Jochen Steinmann (Mikrolab.GmbH@t-online.de)
Holger Rabenau (rabenau@em.uni-frankfurt.de)

Version: 2 Date: 31 October 2006

Author’s response to reviews: see over
Comments

Julian Druce

General comments

1. The range of stock virus titres is now described for each virus in the method section.Titration of control virus (exposure to water instead of disinfectant) was performed at 60 s (longest exposure time) which is now described in the method section. The mode of calculating log reduction is now described in the method section.
2. Cytotoxicity: Further details on the determination of cytotoxicity are now provided in the method section.
3. The infectivity was indeed only based on cytopathic effects. No confirmatory additional assessments were carried out as the chosen test method which is described as a European norm and a national test method does not require to do them. In addition, the discrimination between between cytopathic effects and viral CPE is now explained in the method section (“cytotoxicity”).
4. Each experiment was performed at 3 exposure times which are the basis to have confidence in the results despite single tests.
5. The identities of the agents is now mentioned in the legend to the table.

Major compulsory revision

More details are now included in the method section to describe how the titre reduction was determined.

Minor essential revision

The identities of the hand rubs are now described in the legend of table 1.

Andreas Sauerbrei

Page 4, paragraph 2, last sentence: This is correct. We have added that it could have been a “recently emerging” enveloped virus.
Page 5, inactivation assay: Exposure times are now mentioned.
Page 7, results: The sentence has been shifted to the method section.
Page 10, paragraph 2: The sentence was deleted.
Table 1: The size is now reduced according to the suggestion. The composition is now mentioned in the legend. The abbreviations were reviewed and elucidated when necessary.

In addition, a native speaker has revised the whole manuscript.