Reviewer’s report

Title: Primary muscular cystic hydatidosis: case report

Version: 1 Date: 13 October 2006

Reviewer: Hector H. H. Garcia

Reviewer’s report:

General
- Nice case report. It leads readers to consider that this parasitic disease is endemic in parts of the developed world, and that muscle hydatidosis, albeit infrequent, occurs.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

- The cysts do not grow 1 cm per mont (Background). Some people says they gro 1 cm per year, but this is a very gross estimation.
- There should be a clear differentiation of the ranking of hydatid disease in the differential diagnosis in endemic versus non endemic countries.
- The inial serological tests were sub-optimal assays. This should be mentioned.
- Not clear for this reviewer what is the help provided by the PCR (over adequate, species specific serology as the WB).

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

- Needs some polishing in the English grammar and spelling
- Multilocular hydatidosis should be mentioned and discussed in the differential

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I have collaborated with some of the authors in the past in other research not related to this work.