Reviewer's report

Title: Comparison of Two Interferon Gamma Release Assays in the diagnosis of Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection and disease in The Gambia

Version: 1 Date: 28 June 2007

Reviewer: Jae-Joon Yim

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript focuses on the comparison of two IGRA among TB patients and contacts. Although this study was straightforward and well-written, it was hard to find something definitely new in this manuscript.

- This study performed in house ELISPOT instead of commercialized T.SPORT.TB and QTF-in tube rather than QTF-TB Gold assay. Given that large body of data is available from T.SPORT TB assay kit and QTF-TB Gold assay rather that QTF-in tube, the data in this manuscript could be varied because of the tests method.

- The observation that ELISPOT is more accurate than QTF-TB assay in terms of diagnosis of TB disease. It is different from previous publication (Kang YA et al. Chest 2007, In press) The authors can refer this paper and may discuss about the previous reports on the comparison of two IGRAS.

- In results part of abstract, the authors mention that ‘significant discordance between the IGRAs and TST, mostly from IGRA positive and TST negative combinations’. However, 24 had TST positive / ELISPOT negative and 40 had TST negative / ELISPOT positive. I don’t think, the author can say ‘mostly’.

- It could be much easier for readers to understand this manuscript, if the authors present the results of two IGRA and TST in a table format.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests