Reviewer’s report

Title: Association of SARS susceptibility with single nucleic acid polymorphisms of OAS1 and MxA genes: A Case-Control Study

Version: 2 Date: 2 March 2006

Reviewer: Maria R. R Capobianchi

Reviewer’s report:

General
The Authors have addressed all the relevant points, and the paper has been actually improved. However the results of multivariate analysis are still confused, and last sentence of page 10 does not match well the results shown in tables 3 and 4 (former table 3). It would be better to directly say that individuals with OAS1 AG genotype are at decreased risk, and those with MxA genotype GT are at increased risk of contracting SARS infection, as compared to AA and GG for OAS1, and to GG and TT for MxA, respectively. Individual p values for such genotypes as compared to the two others should be reported in Tables 3 and 4. The present arrangement of placing the p values only associated to the variable is misleading and does not clarify the point. As a matter of fact, p values reported for genotype, for both OAS1 and MxA, are not significant, while the 95% CI of OR are more informative on the statistical value of the different OR.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
Modify the last sentence of results (multivariate analysis) and add p values to match the corresponding data in tables 3 and 4.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests