Reviewer's report

Title: Catheter-related bacteremia due to Kocuria rosea in a patient undergoing peripheral blood stem cell transplantation

Version: 1 Date: 20 September 2004

Reviewer: Paolo De Paoli

Reviewer's report:

General
The authors describe the isolation of a gram positive coccus phenotypically identified as Kocuria rosea from blood drawn from CVC and from a catheter tipi in a patient who underwent ASCT

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1) This case does not meet the criteria for a cathether related bacteremia, i.e. the isolation of a microrganism from the blood drawn from a peripheral vein or a quantitative positive culture from the catheter only (Mermel CID 2001). In the case described here there's no evidence of a systemic infection; data presented suggest a colonization. Besides the absence of a positive culture from peripheral blood, it must be kept in mind that the Maki technique is not very specific to diagnose a CVC related bacteremia (See Siegman Igra J Clin Microbiol 1997). There was any positivity in blood drawn from a peripheral vein AND from the catheter? Did the Authors perform quantitative blood cultures OR a Differential Time to Positivity (Blot Lancet 1999)?

2) Identification of unusual gram positive cocci cannot rely on phenotypic tests alone. Authors must perform additional molecular identification assays (sequencing, rybotyping).

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

There are typing errors (backround two times, rather than background; conlusions rather than conclusions)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

NONE