Reviewer's report

Title: Association of Atopobium vaginae, a recently described metronidazole resistant anaerobe, with bacterial vaginosis

Version: 1 Date: 5 December 2003

Reviewer: Jane Schwebke

Reviewer's report:

General

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
1. Please describe the training and experience of the person who interpreted the Gram stains - what type of quality assurance measures were in place
2. Please add more detail to the vaginal culture section - media used, exact concentrations used for organisms, etc
3. For the 2 patients with normal Gram stain scores and bands consistent with A. vaginae were the slides reviewed? what were the clinical data for those patients - signs, symptoms, Amsel criteria?
4. Although you state that you performed susceptibility studies on the ATCC control you only show the data for metronidazole - please provide the additional data
5. page 12 - 55% of patients is barely a "majority of patients" - this is misleading
6. why do you suppose that these bands are not present in all BV patients if the organism is important in pathogenesis
7. page 13 - are the same patients presented in this manuscript going to be presented in the future manuscript? if so, this may represent duplicative publication and the results of the quantitative cultures should be included in this manuscript
8. page 14 - other organisms associated with BV are also metronidazole resistant such as Mobiluncus curtisii - this should be mentioned
9. If the organism is susceptible to clindamycin how do you explain similar cure and recurrence rates with clind and metronidazole?
10. Figure 1 - it would be good to show an example of a patient with intermediate flora by Gram stain as well

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests: None