Reviewer's report

Title: Older age does not influence CD4 cell recovery in HIV-1 infected patients receiving Highly Active Anti Retroviral Therapy.

Version: 1 Date: 13 April 2004

Reviewer: G. Paolo Rizzardi

Reviewer's report:

General
In the reviewer's opinion, the objective of the study is of value. Unfortunately, this reviewer believes that the manuscript does not represent a significant advance, because very similar results have already been published by the same Authors last year (Tamburello M, AIDS 2003, 17(6):128-131). Furthermore, this reviewer does not think that data reported in AIDS are preliminary in comparison to those presented in the present manuscript because the number of cases is very similar, increasing from 58 to 69. Finally, in many parts of the manuscript, the Authors use exactly the same wording as compared to that published in AIDS: the Discussion section is literally cut and pasted.

-------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
Figures 1, 2 and 3: all figures should read the number of valid cases computed at each time point, and the standard deviation values around the mean (or the confidence intervals).
-------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
-------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Reject because too small an advance to publish in any journal

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
None.