Reviewer's report

Title: Vaccine candidates derived from a novel infectious cDNA clone of an American genotype dengue virus type 2

Version: 3 Date: 19 August 2004

Reviewer: rebeca rico-hesse

Reviewer's report:

General

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct).

The results/discussion of the mosquito infection experiments should be clarified or corrected. Unfortunately for the authors, the comparison of oral infectious doses for A.aegyti mosquitoes was not complete. Since their wild-type American genotype parent virus did not infect and disseminate in these mosquitoes (none of the 3 preparations did), there is no point of comparison for the attenuated infectious clone. The authors mention a previous report showing that the NGC strain does infect and disseminate in this system. However, that is an incorrect reference since it was not done under the same conditions; that strain should have been included here as a positive control. This can be clarified verbally in the paper and they could also clarify if the same aliquot or stock of virus was used for the T. amboinensis infections.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

Table 2 is unnecessary since Table 5 is included.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

None