Reviewer's report

Title: Common variable immunodeficiency syndrome with right aortic arch; a case report

Version: 2 Date: 18 November 2003

Reviewer: Rafal Pawliczak

Reviewer's report:

General
The paper by dr Didem A Yalcin et al. sounds interesting as a case report but several parts of the paper needs to be improved.

Major Compulsory Revisions
The paper seems to be interesting as a simply case report but several points need to be addressed before publication:
1. The picture quality needs to be improved before publication, because they are the major material for the paper.
2. does the patient have family history of CVID (or IgA deficiency)?
3. does she have any autoantibodies?
4. She was presented with an anemia (Hb 8.8 g/dl), what was her RBC? What caused her anemic status?
5. The patient was admitted with an infection and low PFTs, did the PFTs improve after the treatment? Does she smoke?
6. Language of the paper needs major revision and improvement, especially regarding grammar. Exp. "coarse crackles auscultated", "her blood chemistries", "immunohistochemical analysis revealed these levels:" [followed by the flow cytometry data], and many similar errors.
7. Some editing errors are also present exp. page 1 line 11, page 3 line 4 etc
8. Discussion needs to be improved by citing papers about inherited ID coexisting with vascular abnormalities.
10. We need better history regarding parasite infections.
11. The CVID diagnosis cannot be established based only on flow data as stated in the paper. Whole clinical picture supported by sufficient lab results allows one for making a statement.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

none