Reviewer's report

Title: Determination of decimal reduction time (D value) of sanitary agents in hospital usage.

Authors:

Priscila G Mazzola (priscila_mazzola@hotmail.com)
Dr Thereza CV Penna (tcvpena@usp.br)
Alzira M Martins (alzira_martins@edwards.com)

Version: 3 Date: 28 Jul 2003

Reviewer: Gerald McDonnell

Level of interest: A paper of limited interest

Advice on publication: Other (see below)

Thank you for the opportunity to consider this paper again. I do believe that most of my comments have been addressed and I thank the authors for that.

I do still have a concern on one issue, that is concerning the test methodology. It is unusual to find that alcohol/chlorhexide mixtures would show any activity against spores, and may reflect log reduction of vegetative cells that remain in the spore population used for testing or indeed an inhibitory effect from the growth media (due to inadequate or inefficient neutralizer, it would be unusual to find that one neutralizer would work for all actives tested and I could not find any control data that looked at this for each active.

The conclusions should also address that these suspension studies are only an indication of efficacy on a surface; surface testing is recommended in the US, Europe etc. The data in the study only reflects the formulations used and may vary from product to product. If these two points can be made to put the paper in perspective, I would be OK to recommend for publication.

Competing interests:

None declared.