Reviewer's report

**Title:** An unusual presentation of Castleman's Disease: A Case Report

**Authors:**
Ifeoma S Izuchukwu MD, MPH (mediizu@yahoo.com)
Kamal Tourbaf MD (ktourbaf@ams.ecmc.edu)
Dr Martin C Mahoney MD, PHD (martin.Mahoney@roswellpark.org)

**Version:** 2 **Date:** 29 May 2003

**Reviewer:** Jonathan Day

**Level of interest:** A paper whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Advice on publication:** Accept after discretionary revisions

This article presents what is thought to be the first case of Castleman's disease in an HIV positive patient that is not associated with Human Herpes Virus - 8 (HHV-8).

Discretionary revisions

1. What makes this article original is the fact that HHV-8 was not found. Might the authors be able to further clarify how they came to this conclusion and how hard they looked? Were the samples tested blood or lymph node biopsy, and what technique was used - PCR, or immunohistochemistry or something else?

2. The authors have described in great detail the presentation and work up of the patient. They include many of the investigations they carried out that yielded negative results and the possible differential diagnoses they excluded. While this approach is important clinically, for the purpose of the article there are other aspects of MCD, HIV and HHV-8 that might be useful to cover to strengthen the discussion:
   
i) More on HHV-8 and it's normal association with both MCD, KS, & lymphoma's in HIV.
ii) More on IL-6 and its role in the pathogenesis and new treatment strategies aimed at blocking IL-6.
   
iii) The role of IL-6, IL-10, CRP in monitoring MCD.
iii) Are there any implications for our understanding of this disease in the context of your findings?

3. Figure 1. For final publication I think higher resolution images would be useful and also some mention in the legend of the level of the scan slice, +/- contast etc. For example we are asked to refer to figure 1 (on page 4) to see retroperitoneal, pelvic and inguinal lymphadenopathy?

4. Figure 2. The high resolution image is totally illegible here and needs correcting prior to publication.

**Competing interests:**
None declared.