Reviewer's report

Title: Determinants for hospitalization among low risk community aquired pneumonia.

Authors:

Dr Zakari Y Aliyu (zyaliyu@cs.com)
Muktar H Aliyu (mhaliyu@yahoo.com)
Ken McCormick (kmccormick@stagnes.org)

Version: 4 Date: 17 Feb 2003

Reviewer: Robert E Siegel

Level of interest: not specified

Advice on publication: Other (see below)

1. Conclusions are supported by the data shown
2. Sufficient details are provided to permit replication of this study
3. The study does adhere to standards for reporting and data deposition
4. The writing is acceptable

Reviewer's Comments:

1. Page 2: It is unclear to me that when the authors speak about African American status as a risk for admission, they are truly eliminating socioeconomic factors from this variable. How have they assured that it is not an economic, in addition to or in fact that they are not measuring indirectly as the variable? This should be addressed in the article
2. Page 7: There is a numerical discrepancy between the percentages in the tables and in the text of the article. (13% vs 12%, 82% vs 88%...) These numbers need to be consistent in the article.
3. Page 7: 3rd line from the bottom, the word "bojth" needs to be corrected.
4. There is no real description in the article about the PSI, how it was developed and how it is supposed to be used and what components are important. The page 4 description is inadequate.
5. Page 10, line three up from the bottom, change plausible to "one hypothesis"
6. In the discussion, there should be mention of the fact that patients older than 50 were excluded from the analysis and that outcomes may have been different had older patients been included
7. There should be references in the body of the article referring to see tables one and two
8. Table 2- there needs to be a key stating parentheses values are percentages
9. Table 2- some of the P-values are missing on the last page
Age 18-49 age>50 excluded page 7

**Competing interests:**

None declared.