Reviewer's report

Title: Pulmonary immune responses to 2009 pandemic influenza A (H1N1) virus in mice

Version: 3 Date: 1 April 2014

Reviewer: Justin Julander

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions:

The manuscript compares the pathogenicity of two influenza A virus strains in mice. Unfortunately, the frequent grammatical errors throughout the manuscript detract from the content. It does not appear that the authors have substantially addressed this concern that was brought up in an initial review. In addition, it does not appear that the manuscript brings much new to the field and similar work has been extensively published. The authors fail to demonstrate the novelty of their work. The statistical analysis does not appear to have been done correctly, and significant differences are indicated where they would not be expected. Perhaps more robust analysis should be applied.

The focus is on the inflammatory response, although cytokine profiles were measured every other day. Some were shown to be elevated at a single time point. I would recommend filling in the complete picture of cytokine elevation, as this is a major focus of the paper.

A table covering various mutations between the two strains was included towards the end of the manuscript, which appears to have been taken from another publication. It is unclear why this information was included and seems out of place. I would suggest removing the table.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests