Reviewer’s report

Title: Is Elevated Red Cell Distribution Width a Prognostic Predictor in Adult Patients with Community Acquired Pneumonia?

Version: 1
Date: 8 December 2013

Reviewer: Patrick Lillie

Reviewer’s report:

Minor Essential Revisions

1) The definition of Community Acquired Pneumonia should be specified in greater detail - are the authors including everyone who had a diagnosis of CAP included in their notes (which may or may not be correct) or are they radiologically confirmed new infiltrates on chest x-ray?

Discretionary revisions

1) It would be interesting to have some discussion around the mechanism / reason behind the association of mortality and RCDW. Also it would be interesting to see if the addition of RDW to current assessment scores such as CURB-65 improves the performance of the score.

2) The manuscript is very long and it may well be more readable if some of the tables / results were incorporated into supplementary information. For example, the paragraphs and associated figures on Charlson score and mortality, the relationship between RDW and different blood count indices and RDW and BUN could all be summarised in supplementary information or condensed

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests