Reviewer’s report

Title: The association of HPV-16 seropositivity and natural immunity to reinfection: insights from compartmental models

Version: 4 Date: 20 December 2012

Reviewer: Johannes A Bogaards

Reviewer’s report:

The manuscript has clearly benefitted from the input of three independent reviewers. I still do not buy into the notion of simplicity being more important than accuracy; omitting a “persistently infected” model compartment is simply inaccurate to my mind. I also disagree that inclusion of such a compartment would complicate parameter estimation. Nevertheless, the authors have done well in probing HPV serology from a mathematical perspective and their approach (while questionable) might incite other researchers to investigate alternative explanations. This would be a good thing.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

No competing interests.