Reviewer’s report

Title: Procalcitonin Guided Antibiotic Therapy of Acute Exacerbations of Asthma

Version: 3 Date: 19 November 2012

Reviewer: Alan Kaplan

Reviewer’s report:

The article is of interest and could make changes to how chest infections could be treated, esp in asthmatics. The HUGE issue that jumps out is that we have no idea in those people who were treated or not as to the success of the treatment. There are NO outcome measures. They simply did an evaluation of whether or not the PCT was elevated and decided on treatment, but did that work? In order to be ov value, the article must review the follow up of those treated. If there were no less complications, secondary visits or repeated needs of steroids or antibiotics in the PCT group, then we have a positive outcome and the value of the test is there. Further discussion of limitations of the testing would also be indicated.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

no conflicts