Reviewer's report

Title: Per oral Substitution with 300000 IE Vitamin D Reduces Bone Turnover Markers and Increases 25-OH Vitamin D Levels in HIV-positive Patients

Version: 2 Date: 19 October 2013

Reviewer: Giovanni Guaraldi

Reviewer's report:

Dr. Piso and co-authors compare efficacy of 300,000 IU of daily Vitamin D oral substitution in 96 HIV infected patients and 70 HBV or HCV monoinfected controls.

Efficacy was arbitrary chosen as >10% reduction in one or both of the two cross links.

The most interesting result of the study is that ART was correlated with better response to vitamin D supplementation (OR 2.76, CI 1.58 – 4.53, p=0.002), however the low number of patients without antiretroviral treatment limits the statistical value of this data.

The strength of this paper are the capacity to measure the efficacy of an interventional study of vitD supplementation, the presence of a control group.

Major concern of the study are the poor characterization of the study population (particularly HCV and HBV infected individuals), the lack od DEXA measurements, lack of nutritional data.

Methods are not very clear. Inclusion criteria and collection of adverse events are poorly described.

My suggestion is to consider this paper a proof of principle and use these data as references for properly designed future prospective study. In this perspective I suggest to publish it as a research letter or short communication.

The paper needs substantial rewriting both for English and scientific language issues.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests’ below