Reviewer’s report

Title: Prevalence of Human Papillomavirus in young Italian women with normal cytology. How should we adapt the national vaccination policy?

Version: 4 Date: 8 September 2013

Reviewer: Kate Soldan

Reviewer’s report:

Responses to previous comments have been done by minor textual changes, in places in a tokenistic fashion. The data and analyses have not been re-prioritised to focus on HR HPV type epidemiology (previous comment 1). The conclusions remain an overstatement of the data presented (previous comment 2).

I do not find these data to be evidence suggestive that "vaccinating 26 year old females at the time of their first pap-test is to be recommended", as in abstract. Restricting this comment to pap negative women would not solve the problem: there is more to consider.

The additional justification for the conclusion that has been added to the discussion does not change the "evidence" presented in this paper, and is somewhat selective, e.g. cites an abstract re cost-effectiveness of HPV vaccine use in UK conducted by the vaccine manufacturers and does not cite the cost-effectiveness model conducted by the public health system that was used to inform vaccine use in the UK.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

None