Reviewer’s report

Title: Cytotoxic response persists in subjects treated for tuberculosis decades ago

Version: 1 Date: 28 October 2013

Reviewer: Elisa Petruccioli

Reviewer’s report:

This is an interesting and well-written paper that gain an insight into the discriminatory power of CTLs comparing the frequencies and the functional and phenotypic profiles of CTLs in patients with acute pulmonary or extra-pulmonary TB or LTBI, and in cured TB patients in whom TB had been diagnosed and differently treated decades ago.

The paper is well written and the reported data seem to be interesting to better understand the immunological response to M. tuberculosis. The author have satisfied the reviewer requests therefore I recommend this paper for publication with minor and major revision:

Minor revision
Line 38 please correct p<0.5 with p<0.05
Line 223 in the paragraph “Phenotypic analysis of CD8+CD107a+ cells”, the author should better describe the figure 4 because the message is unclear, I did not understand what the author mean: the major proportion of specific T cells has an effector memory phenotype (figure 4B) while the higher frequency of response of specific T cells is associate to central memory phenotype (figure 4C)? The author should better describe the figure in the result section, in the figure legend and consequently find a better description of the ass y in the figure 4.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests