Reviewer’s report

**Title:** Comparison of the performance of carcinogenic HPV typing of the Roche Linear Array and Qiagen LiquiChip HPV assays

**Version:** 2  **Date:** 1 July 2013

**Reviewer:** Martin Steinau

Reviewer’s report:

This manuscript describes the performance of the Qiagen LQ HPV genotyping test with respect to its clinical sensitivity for CIN2+ and analytically in comparison to the Roche Linear Array. The materials and methods are adequately described and the analyses appears to be satisfactory.

The following issues should be addressed in a Revision:

The sample population was recruited from referral colposcopy clinics and implies that the study addresses the clinical utility of this HPV genotyping test specifically for triaging women with abnormal pap test. The authors should state this clearly in the Background and possibly even in the abstract.

Positive predictive value is stated as a major evaluation criteria under the Objectives, but not calculated and not taken into consideration in the discussion or conclusion. It looks like this value should be in table 2, but got omitted for some reason.

The discussion of type specific discrepancies needs improvement. The meaning of the sentence “All the cases where the listed HPV types were detected by Qiagen LQ … “ (p. 8, 199) is unclear. The referenced overestimation of HPV by Linear Array due to cross hybridization (p. 8, 202) is specific to HPV type 52 and may not explain the higher detection rates for other types.

One would expect that utility of type specific information (i.e. HPV16, 18) and clinical performance as illustrated in figure 1 and 2 would be discussed at some point.

The study population is relatively low for clinical evaluation and should be mentioned as a limitation.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests