Reviewer's report

Title: Effect of Ganciclovir for the Treatment of Severe Cytomegalovirus-Associated Pneumonia in Children without Specific Immunocompromised Status

Version: 3 Date: 18 April 2013

Reviewer: Klaus Hamprecht

Reviewer's report:

Discretionary Revisions

After careful revision the authors present important data on GCV treatment of CMV pneumonia in mostly term infants without any obvious immunosuppression. The main result is the absence of toxicity in their cohort. However there remain some unanswered questions: it is not possible to exclude congenital CMV infection in the study cohort. Nevertheless, the manuscript of Doan et al. makes an interesting contribution to the field of GCV treated newborns: the risks for toxic side effects seems to be lower as expected in their study cohort.

The authors should include into the Discussion section, that the study design has certain limitations with respect to acquisition of the infection, the imbalanced age groups in Tab 2. Last point: please explain the increase of plasma viral load in Fig 1 after one week of GCV and would it be also possible to show such data also for BAL?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests