Reviewer's report

Title: AFLP analysis reveals high genetic diversity but low population structure in Coccidioides posadasii isolates from Mexico and Argentina

Version: 4 Date: 26 February 2013

Reviewer: Theo Kirkland

Reviewer's report:

The problems previously noted with organization and English have been corrected.

This is a study of C. posadasii isolates from MX and AR, showing that there is no difference in growth rate in high salt (which would not be predicted since they are all C. posadasii) or antigen detection assay results. Since the detecting antibody is polyclonal this would be expected.

The observation that there is a good deal of variability in C. posadasii in this population and that AR and MX populations are not different from each other is well supported. The implications of this latter observation are not discussed. Adding discussion of the implications of panmixia would improve the paper.

A big limitation of this study is that there is no connection between this study and a previous study of the population genomics of C. posadasii in the US (doi: 10.1101/gr.103911.109. Epub 2010 Jun 1). In addition, since there is no DNA sequence, it will be difficult to compare this study to any other studies of C. posadasii or C. immitis. This is a major limitation. I would think that an analysis of a moderate amount of DNA sequence would be very helpful. In addition, the DNA sequence data itself might be very useful for comparison in future studies. At a minimum, the limitations of the approach that the authors have pursued should be discussed in the manuscript.

Table 1 would be more appropriate as supplemental data.

Table 2 would be easier to understand as a figure.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.