Reviewer's report

Title: Determinants of Performance of Supplemental Immunization Activities for Polio Eradication in Uttar Pradesh, India: Social Mobilization Activities of the Social Mobilization Network (SM Net) and Core Group Polio Project (CGPP)

Version: 1 Date: 3 August 2012

Reviewer: Sophie Hill

Reviewer's report:

This is an interesting paper attempting to find out more about which components of campaigns are associated with polio vaccination.

Major compulsory edit:

1. My main concern is the apparent strength of the ‘recommendation’ in the Policy Implications section. On the basis of the analysis, a lower limit of mosque announcement and Bullawa Tollies is proposed, which implies a correct ‘dose’ and also implies that it could be exceeded. Yet two other factors were also significantly associated with good outcomes, number of children under 5 and ‘district’. And the paper acknowledges that little is known about the district factors. I think I would feel more comfortable if there was more recognition of uncertainty about the recommendations and the exact numbers of these activities, perhaps through some small wording changes.

2. I also wondered about time span. In the context of an SIA and a specification of some discrete activities, are you recommending ‘more than 48 mosque announcements’ in a specific time period?

3. There are useful descriptions of the components of social mobilization activities but I couldn’t find a description of ‘rallies’ (apologies if I missed this). It may be obvious but given they must require effort on the part of the CMC, perhaps there could be a description of what they usually contain. This is important because the paper recommends a limit to the number of rallies, as well as more attention to their quality. A sentence or two would be good.

Minor optional:

4. This is a minor comment but there are many acronyms in this paper and I wondered if a short acronym table might help readers to check quickly.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.
Declaration of competing interests:

I am an investigator in the COMMVAC project, which has an interest in improving the evidence base of communication strategies to improve vaccination in low and middle income countries. There is no conflict of interest.