Reviewer’s report

Title: Diagnostic performance of line-immunoassay based algorithms for incident HIV-1 infection

Version: 2 Date: 23 March 2012

Reviewer: Ming-Wei Lin

Reviewer’s report:

In the revised manuscript of Jörg Schüpbach et al, most of the reviewer’s comments have been addressed and modified. However, the following comments should be further clarified and solved.

Major Compulsory revisions:

1. As the authors indicated that the cohorts A, B, C, and D are indeed different, as each represents patients newly diagnosed during different time periods. Although they pointed out the purpose is to compare datapoint in different cohorts under the same algorithm, the use of paired t test is inappropriate unless the subjects in cohorts A, B, C, and D were repeated.

Minor comments:

1. What is logistic likelihood ratio (LLR) chi-square values? This term seems not commonly used in the statistical methods.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests