Reviewer's report

**Title:** Trends in missed presentations and late HIV diagnosis in a UK teaching hospital: a retrospective comparative cohort study

**Version:** 2  **Date:** 9 November 2011

**Reviewer:** Enrico Girardi

**Reviewer's report:**

Major compulsory revisions
The abstract is not easy to follow. Different outcomes are presented: missed indications for HIV testing, late diagnosis (CD4 < 350 cells/mm³), time to diagnosis, missed presentation (same as missed presentation?), but only late diagnosis is defined.

In my opinion paragraph reporting the analysis on clinical aspects (last paragraph of Results) is not clear and should be rewritten. In particular:
- Does the first paragraph refer to an overall description of the study population?
- What do the authors mean by progression to AIDS? prevalence of clinically diagnosed AIDS?
- Why do the authors use WHO staging? The may wish to consider not to include this classification as it may be redundant when CD4 cell count is available
- What do the author mean with progression after missed presentation? No numbers are provided on this aspect (last sentence of the paragraph)

In the results section The following sentence me “The proportion of patients diagnosed within one year of first presentation was 77% in the earlier cohort and 92% in the later cohort (HR = 1.36, 95% CI: 0.96 to 1.94; P = 0.084)” is unclear tome; how the HR was calculated? Does the comparison refer to the one year data only?

Minor essential revisions
The definition of “time to diagnosis” should be included in the “Definitions” paragraph

Discretionary Revisions
In Background: “Universal ‘opt-out’ testing in all general healthcare settings” has been recommended in some countries, but I would not say that it has been “adopted”

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable
**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests