Reviewer’s report

Title: Infection by H1N1 pandemic virus and Tnf 308, Tnf 252, Tnf 238, Tnf 376, Il1Beta, IL6, IL8, ccl1 in Mexican population: Case-Control Study

Version: 2 Date: 19 April 2012

Reviewer: Kemin Xu

Reviewer’s report:

In this manuscript, Guadalupe Morales-García et al tried to answer the questions whether the polymorphisms at some cytokines and chemokines are related to the infection and severity of the infection with the H1N1 pandemic virus in patients from Mexico. By analyzing the polymorphisms at TNF -308, TNF +252, TNF -238, TNF -376, IL1#, IL6, IL8, CCL1, they concluded the genetic variants within genes involved in the inflammatory process could have contributed to the differences in clinical behavior of the infection by H1N1 pandemic influenza virus. However, the conclusions they drew may not be supported by the data they presented.

Major compulsory revisions:

1) The sample sizes were too small, especially for seasonal flu (n=9). Any comparisons involved in seasonal flu data may not the real one.

2) Without any virological data, it’s very hard to proof the conclusions, like the association between TNF+252AG genotype and mortality. It may possibly result from higher level of virus replication.

3) Both background and discussion sections were not written in a professional way. They authors should focus more on the questions they want to answer and their findings. Especially in discussion section, it was unnecessarily long for irrelevant discussions and background information.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.