Reviewer’s report

Title: Adherence to recommendations by infectious disease consultants and its influence on outcomes of intravenous antibiotic-treated hospitalized patients

Version: 3 Date: 3 July 2012

Reviewer: Colleen Bamford

Reviewer’s report:

This is an interesting study of hospitalized patient with more than 3 days of IV antibiotic therapy, randomized to intervention consisting of written recommendations by ID physician. The study evaluated adherence to recommendations – 40% did not adhere. In multivariate analysis of clinical outcome complete adherence was associated with successful outcome.

The study question is well posed and methods are appropriate and well described. (?chose to use p < 0.001 to account for multiple comparisons – not sure if this is acceptable.) The discussion and conclusions are appropriate, but could try to avoid repetition of some of the findings. Otherwise well written, the abstract and title are accurate.

The finding that microbiological tests were more frequently requested in patients randomized to the intervention, and that there was a higher percentage of positive cultures, suggests that ID consultation in addition to antibiotic advice also consciously or unconsciously influenced test request practices, and possibly led to more appropriate selection of sites for microbiological tests.

Table 2 and possibly Table 3 do not add very much value to the study.

Characteristics of antibiotic treatments prior to ID recommendations: this section could be condensed/ clarified.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests'