Reviewer's report

Title: Cholera risk factors, Papua New Guinea, 2010

Version: 2 Date: 5 March 2012

Reviewer: Firdausi Qadri

Reviewer's report:

1. More data and publications available on the POC used from Standard Diagnostics must be added to the manuscript. The specificity and sensitivity are rather low and therefore cannot be used in an evaluation such as this one. However, not all diagnostics in cholera are of such specificity. As suggested, training of use and interpretation of data on POCs need to be made prior to its use and this is not clear from the evaluation carried out.

2. Definition of ‘town water’ needs to be made to better describe this terminology.

3. Culture results from cases but not the controls have been given. Data from the controls also need to be inserted in the case/control study design.

4. Were specimens tested only for V. cholerae and not other enteric pathogens. This appears to be a limiting factor since enterotoxigenic Escherichia coli causing is also very common in diarrhea prone endemic and epidemic settings globally.

5. The discussion is very lengthy and dwells for long on the measures that need to be taken for cholera prevention and can be considerably shortened. The affordable cholera vaccine was prequalified by WHO in September 2011 and the information on page 18 should be corrected.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.