Reviewer’s report

Title: Clinical and Temporal Patterns of Severe Pneumonia Causing Critical Illness during Hajj

Version: 4 Date: 9 March 2012

Reviewer: Katherine Gibney

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
Nil

Minor Essential Revisions
• Figure legend (1,2a,2b,3) does not match label on figures (1,2,3,4)

Discretionary Revisions
• Background
  o Para 1, sentences 3–5: Shorten this description (interesting information but could be more concise)
  o Para 1, sentence 9: do not list all sizes, rather … ranged in size from 4mx4m through 8mx12m
  o Para 2, sentence 3: add word “approximately” before number of new cases of pneumonia
• Methods
  o Para 1, sentence 7: were all the MTb cases included culture confirmed? If so, please clarify this. If not, please specify the proportion which was laboratory confirmed.
• Conclusion
  o Sentence 1: I question use of the word “common” when you have shown there are 21 episodes of pneumonia causing critical illness per million Hajj pilgrims. Perhaps you are referring to it causing a large proportion of all critical illnesses during Hajj?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests