Reviewer’s report

Title: Crystalloid or colloid boluses for the management of dengue shock syndrome in the presence of ascites and pleural effusions?

Version: 1 Date: 8 August 2010

Reviewer: Aysha Almas

Reviewer’s report:

- Major Compulsory Revisions
  1. Introduction should mention briefly with reference about crystalloids and colloids with reference, how they are different in composition
  In the last para of introduction, the author uses the term pulmonary edema and cardiac failure interchangeable. Author should restrict and use only pulmonary edema, as these terms are separate entities.
  2. In the case presentation section; The summary of clinical presentation of all 3 patients is not at all adequate and does not have a systematic scientific approach. Author should narrate all three cases separately with demographics, clinical presentation, initial assessment, a table showing labs of the 3 patients. Mention about the amount of effusion and ascities of all 3 patients, the amount of total crystalloid given to all, and after how much of iv resuscitaion they developed pulmonary edema, did they require invasive ventilation
  3. Again authors should avoid using pulmonary edema and cardiac failure interchangeably
  4. Was echo done in all these cases to rule out underlying heart disease?
  5. Was central venous pressure measured in all three patients?
  6. The entire discussion needs to be rewritten. No references have been used at all to discuss which is not acceptable at all. Authors should talk about use of crystalloids versus colloids use in infection, why the use may have different results in patients of dengue

- Minor Essential Revisions
  7. Concluding remark in the abstract should indicate that crystalloids may have association with pulmonary edema in patients with DSS who have thirdspace fluid accumulation

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

no competing results