Reviewer's report

Title: Mycobacterium genavense as a cause of subacute pneumonia in patients with severe cellular immunodeficiency

Version: 1 Date: 27 July 2011

Reviewer: Christopher CZaja

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions: none
Minor Essential Revisions: The discussion is somewhat hard to follow, and major points aren't clearly made until the last paragraph. I recommend the discussion be revised and streamlined so the major points are clearly made. As I understand them: 1) These cases are different than previously reported because they are primarily pulmonary cases without dissemination, although severe 2) Diagnosis was prolonged, because the organism is fastidious 3) Successful treatment required immune reconstitution, either by treatment of HIV or reduction in immune suppression, and 4) prolonged antimycobacterial therapy, in these cases clarithromycin, ethambutol and a rifamycin. 5) IFNg was used in one case and may be helpful for recovery.

Discretionary Revisions: Do you have any clinical pearls, for example consider M. genevense infection (or other fastidious NTM) in immunnosuppressed persons with pneumonia who are AFB smear +, but negative cultures, and should empiric coverage be considered earlier in these patients?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests