Reviewer’s report

Title: Mycobacterium genavense as a cause of subacute pneumonia in patients with severe cellular immunodeficiency

Version: 1 Date: 27 June 2011

Reviewer: Theodore Marras

Reviewer’s report:

The authors present an informative series and draw attention to an uncommon presentation of an uncommon NTM infection

minor essential revisions:

1. The authors should describe how they chose the duration of therapy for case 1. Was there a minimum time period of negative cultures? Possibly a minimum number of months after maximal radiographic improvement? Possibly a combined endpoint?

2. The figure legends for the chest radiographs should describe the radiographic abnormalities. It is difficult to move between text and figure to read the authors’ interpretation of the imaging.

3. The Figure legend for Figure 2 should note that the images are from Case 1.

4. Figure 4 A is described as showing mediastinal lymphadenopathy. However, the LNs that are indicated by the arrows appear to be approximately 10-15 mm in long axis. To me they appear to be of no more than borderline significance.

5. Line 147 - I do not understand the term sub-occlusion in the context used here.

6. I would greatly appreciate dose information and justification regarding the antimycobacterials. This would probably best be provided as mg/kg and the reason for any deviation from standard doses.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests