Reviewer’s report

Title: Actinobaculum schaalii - invasive pathogen or innocent bystander?: a retrospective observational study

Version: 1 Date: 1 June 2011

Reviewer: Vincent Cattoir

Reviewer’s report:

General comment
In their manuscript, Tschudin-Sutter et al. report the largest case series of infections caused by Actinobaculum schaalii in Switzerland over an 11-year period. The authors identified this species in 12 urinary samples (it is now well established that this species is responsible for UTIs in elderly patients with underlying urological predispositions), but also in 21 blood cultures and 7 deep tissue biopsies.

Since this microorganism appears to be an emerging pathogen, data in this work are quite interesting and clinically relevant. Even if several papers already reported the clinical significance of A. schaalii in UTIs, its description in other clinical specimens is scarcer. However, two major limits of this work are: 1/ the retrospective nature of the study, and 2/ the absence of antimicrobial susceptibility testing (AST) data.

Specific comments
- What was the bacterial concentration of A. schaalii recovered from urinary samples? What was the cut-off value the authors used?
- All deep tissue samples were polymicrobial, but what was the relative proportion of A. schaalii in these specimens? Was A. schaalii predominant?
- Did any patients suffer from endocarditis?
- Tables 3 and 4 could be omitted.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.