Reviewer's report

Title: Ventilator-associated pneumonia incidence in intensive care units within the first 48 hours after hospital admission: a surveillance-based study

Version: 1 Date: 28 March 2011

Reviewer: Laurent PAPAZIAN

Reviewer's report:

The study done by Dr. Vanhems and co-workers aimed at estimating the incidence of pneumonia occurring in within 48 hours after ICU admission. 3,387 patients were surveyed. 367 developed a pneumonia within the first 9 days. The predicted cumulative VAP incidence at D0 and D1 was 5.3 and 8.3, respectively.

Minor essential revisions

- Regarding the microbiological criteria, some points need to be detailed by the authors :
  * If the authors did not use a plugged catheter to perform BAL, this is not a protected specimen. It is rather a directed BAL.
  * What is a « protected tracheal aspirate » ? This needs some more details and at least one reference.
  * What is a « non-protected bronchoscopic specimen » Is it an aspirate obtained by fiberoptic bronchoscopy ?

Finally the authors must give the reference for this definition of VAP.

Discretionary revision

- The reviewer suggests to change VAP for early-onset pneumonia regarding pneumonia diagnosed within the first 48-h period following intubation.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests