Reviewer's report

Title: Duration of viral shedding in hospitalized patients infected with pandemic H1N1

Version: 3 Date: 29 November 2010

Reviewer: Michael Ison

Reviewer's report:

Thank you for allowing me to re-review the paper by Meschi and colleagues entitled "Duration of viral shedding in hospitalized patients infected with pandemic H1N1." The authors have generally addressed my major concerns. Although the English is improved, the paper seems minimally edited - the responses frequently feel tacked on and don't often flow well with the surrounding text.

Overall, the revision still has some major challenges that appear to be based on their study design/available samples/data:

1. The paper does not add significantly to the available literature although does have some findings that are somewhat discrepant with other reports.
2. The available data are limited which in turn limits the utility of the findings (i.e. only a small subset of patients had serial testing for resistance...)

Otherwise, the paper, if carefully edited, will likely be as helpful to the literature as the underlying data will allow it to be.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

None