Reviewer’s report

Title: Duration of viral shedding in hospitalized patients infected with pandemic H1N1

Version: 3 Date: 10 December 2010

Reviewer: Edward Goldstein

Reviewer’s report:

This is a second referee report on the paper “Duration of viral shedding in hospitalized patients infected with pandemic H1N1” submitted for publication at BMC Infectious Diseases.

The referee thinks the paper has benefited greatly from the revision. In particular the dichotomy of pneumonia vs. non pneumonia as well as antiviral treatment vs. none with regard to the duration of shedding and viral load reduction is now clearly explained in the text and Figure 2A-D.

Those results are very interesting and merit publication.

Minor essential revision: The reviewer’s remaining concern is that it appears from looking at Figure 2 A and 2C that pneumonia is negatively associated with receipt of antivirals. If this is so, the results in Figure 2B and 2C may be biased. Is it possible to examine the effect of one of the variables (pneumonia and (early) antivirals) adjusting for the other? For example, one can do logistic regression where the outcome is PCR detection on days 6-7 (or 8-9) and the variables are pneumonia and antiviral treatment (the former presumably is significant).

Similarly one can do logistic regression where the outcome is Log viral load over 4.5 (or 4.6) on days 4-5 with the same variables.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests