Reviewer's report

Title: Two-stage hip prosthesis for septic hip arthritis using preformed spacers and cementless prosthesis: a prospective, non-randomized cohort study.

Version: 1 Date: 6 March 2011

Reviewer: thomas bauer

Reviewer's report:

Very good manuscript on a very few published subject.
The overall manuscript is well written.
ABSTRACT: OK
INTRODUCTION: OK
METHOD:
presentation of the data and statistical analysis are valid
Surgical management: It is quite unclear wether all the patients had a preoperative hip aspiration and if a medical treatment was attempted for all of them or not (because the delay between onset of the symptoms and surgery is quite long)
Why do you choose between long and short stems for the spacers.
Why not full weight bearing after arthroplasty?
RESULTS:
What can we consider with the 5 cases of negative intraoperative cultures (there are only 4 in the table 1)? Was the preoperative aspiration positive, what are the reasons for negative intraoperative samples?
How explain a so long delay before prosthesis implantation (22 months) although the antibiotic therapy duration was 4 months?
Did you perform a hip aspiration systematically before the second stage?
How did you manage the 2 cases with intraoperative positive cultures at time of arthroplasty (longer antibiotic time?)
DISCUSSION:
It is not sure that the antibiotic mixed in the commercially available cement could have a therapeutic benefit as the levels are to low and only have a prophylactic effect. The most important effect of the spacer is mechanical with maintaining of the joint space and avoiding large shortening.
REFERENCES:
the article is enclosed
TABLES:
only 4 cases of negative intraoperative cultures but 5 in the text.

orthograph for staphylococcus

This manuscript is interesting and could be published with few modifications.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests