Reviewer's report

Title: Modelling imperfect adherence to HIV induction therapy

Version: 2 Date: 17 June 2009

Reviewer: Robert Stengel

Reviewer's report:

I had forgotten that I previously reviewed this paper, so I went through the revision as if I had not seen it before. When I saw that this was a revision, with reviewers’ comments and the authors’ rebuttal, I was struck by how similar my current marginal notes were to my original review. I further noted a relatively high degree of consistency in the first three reviews.

While the authors’ rebuttal addresses all of the points raised in the original reviews and several revisions to the paper were made, my feeling is that the revisions are not sufficiently responsive to the three reviewers’ comments. I (re-)read this paper thoroughly and still had difficulties. Most of my original comments could be made again, and I will not repeat them. Overall, there is a lack of flow and a lack of in-line substantiation. In my view, results are not presented and discussed adequately. There is an imbalance between presentation of the pharmacokinetic and immune-system dynamics. The body of the paper is 9 pages, and the appendices are 6 pages long; a ratio of 13:2 or 12:3 would be more effective and would force the flow to be improved. Important data and definitions are buried in the captions of figures. While the authors have strived to keep the main text concise, they have done so at the expense of clarity. The result is a sterile, wooden paper that obscures its contents.

I am disappointed because the substance of the research presented in the paper seems to be important and interesting. I would like to see that work published; I just don’t think that this paper effectively presents the scientific and technical material.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.