Reviewer’s report

**Title:** Corynebacterium mucifaciens in an immunocompetent patient with excavated pneumonia

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 1 September 2010

**Reviewer:** Charles Feldman

**Reviewer’s report:**

This case report describes the occurrence of a single case of Corynebacterium mucifaciens pneumonia in an immunocompetent patient.

**Major Compulsory Revisions**

1) The title would be more correct if it referred to “cavitating” or “cavitary” pneumonia – the authors use the latter term in the case report.

2) However having indicated the above, I am not certain that I can see a cavitating/cavitary pneumonia on the CT scan, given that it is a black and white printout of the scan. There does appear on the scan to be an area of opacification with a small area of lucency within it, but I wondered whether this was not an air bronchogram, rather than a cavitating pneumonia?

3) Although the authors indicate that the patient was not HIV-infected, could the patient have had another form of immunocompromise, such as immunoglobulin or cellular immune defects? Are such deficiencies described in patients with such infections and are there any recommendations with regard to looking for such deficiencies?

4) Why was the patient treated with rifampicin-spiramycin? What is the recommended therapy for this infection? The authors should add some detail on recommended therapy in the discussion section.

5) Do the authors have a follow up chest radiograph/CT scan and if so what did it/they look like? The authors should, at least, describe the radiographic changes and their progression.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests