Reviewer's report

Title: A case of pulmonary tuberculosis presenting as diffuse alveolar haemorrhage: is there a role for anticardiolipin antibodies?

Version: 1 Date: 19 September 2009

Reviewer: Osman Elbek

Reviewer's report:

The paper needs major compulsory revisions.

1. The ‘Antiphospholipid antibodies have been found in association with many viral, bacterial and parasitic infections. DAH has been, also, described in patients with antiphospholipid syndrome’ phrase is not necessary and should erased from the abstract.

2. It should be specified if the anticardiolipin IgG positivity been showed in 6 weeks interval or not.

3. The platelet count, coagulation functions, urine analysis, echocardiography and complete personal history of the case should be given.

4. The lower extremity venous doppler US and spiral thorax angiography results should present and the differential diagnosis should made for tromboembolism.

5. Some features of the case resembles to the postpartum syndrome. Therefore, if the case is a woman the grosses and parity should stated.


The case with presented situation is showing anticardiolipin IgG positivity in a tuberculosis patient established only one time. Whereas 1-5 per cent of the healty young population expresses anticardiolipin IgG positivity. In addition, the frequency of the positive expression is increases with age in these healty people (Petri M. Epidemiology of the Antiphospholipid antibodies syndrome. J Autoimmunity 2000; 15: 145-51). Thus, the anticardiolipin (aCL) IgG antibody determined in this case can be only a positivity of a healty person. However the tuberculosis and antiphosfolipid relation can be significant according to Elkayam and colleagues (Elkayam O, Caspi D, Lidgi M, Segal R. Auto-antibody profiles in patients with active pulmonary tuberculosis. Int J Tuberc Lung Dis. 2007;11: 306-10). The changes stated above should be made to can institute the relation between the illnes and antibodies.

Best regards
Osman Elbek, MD
Department of Pulmonary Diseases
Faculty of Medicine
University of Gaziantep
Gaziantep/Turkey

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.