**Reviewer's report**

**Title:** Long-term mortality in HIV patients virally suppressed for more than three years with incomplete CD4 recovery: A cohort study.

**Version:** 7  **Date:** 22 July 2010

**Reviewer:** Robert Gross

**Reviewer's report:**

Major revisions:
although the authors state that HCV testing is "intended" to be done yearly, that doesn't mean it actually happens. The authors need to acknowledge this problem in their limitations section noting that the effect of HCV may be limited to those in whom HCV was suspected and thus tested for.

It is not clear how HCV status and IDU status were handled in the multivariable models. I presume they were extremely collinear and couldn't not go into the models simultaneously. The authors need to acknowledge this issue as well.

The authors state that OIs are not different between the groups but the non-responders have a nearly 3x higher rate! This certainly suggests that the immunological non-response is biologically important-perhaps the study was just underpowered to find this different to be statistically significant.

Minor revisions:
there remain several phrases that are awkward in English.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
I declare that I have no competing interests.