Reviewer's report

Title: FIP1L1-PDGFRA molecular analysis in the differential diagnosis of eosinophilia

Version: 3 Date: 15 December 2008

Reviewer: Peter Vandenberghe

Reviewer's report:

The authors study a small series of so-called hypeosinophilic syndrome, of which several turn out to have another diagnosis that is associated with eosinophilia, but that is incompatible with the diagnosis of HES. They set out to determine the prevalence of FIP1L1PDGFRA positive disease in this context, as well as the clinicopathological features. However the prevalence cannot be reliably determined on such a small (and flawed) sample. The clinicopathological features that should be discussed also include the presence or absence of cardiac disease, neuropathy, fluid retention.

In my opinion, there is no novelty to this paper as the data that are shown essentially confirm the literature on the subject. This literature is already extensive at the present time.

Although the authors claim that the paper has been proofread by a native English speaker, the English as used remains difficult and awkward.