Reviewer's report

Title: FIP1L1-PDGFRA molecular analysis in the differential diagnosis of eosinophilia

Version: 1 Date: 6 October 2008

Reviewer: Peter Vandenberghe

Reviewer's report:

The paper by Gedeon Loules et al. is a descriptive paper that describes the prevalence of FIP1L1-PDGFRA positivity in a small group of 14 adults with eosinophils > 1500/mm3, of unknown duration and w/o a history of allergic diseases.

The paper does not detail how these patients were referred, but given that the study was conducted at a university hospital there is a probable referral bias, that may lead by various mechanisms to misrepresentation of the true prevalence of FIP1L1-PDGFRA in eosinophilia > 1500. Moreover, the fact that the diagnosis of asthma, urticaria, and dermatomyositis was made in 4 of these patients, raises questions of how accurately coexistence or pre-existence of allergic diseases was excluded.

The study does not reveal new clinicopathological nor new genetic features of FIP1L1-PDGFRA rearrangement positive disease.