Reviewer's report

Title: Exploring the feasibility of a community-based strength training program for older people with depressive symptoms and its impact on depressive symptoms: a randomised controlled trial

Version: 2  Date: 6 July 2006

Reviewer: Raimo Sulkava

Reviewer's report:

General

The question posed by the authors is important and worth studying.

****************************************************************************

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

As the authors address, this is a pilot study because of small number of study subjects. The authors discuss the problem very well.

For other investigators in this field, the problems in the recruitment and adherence should be discussed even in more detail. E.g. in this age group PRT three times a week is quite much, especially when the subjects are depressed. Twice or even once a week might be enough (see e.g. Timonen et al Int J Geriatr Psychiatry 2002;17:1106-11). A dose-response pattern not necessarily mean that more exercise is more effective in depression. The reason might be also a group of patients who responded quickly and were therefore more active in attending PRT later.

There is only one figure (flow chart). The article could be more readable if there were two tables: one with basic characteristics of the subjects and another with main results.

****************************************************************************

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests