Reviewer's report

Title: Effects of resistance and all-round, functional training on quality of life, vitality and depression of older adults living in long-term care facilities: a 'randomized' controlled trial

Version: 3 Date: 19 May 2004

Reviewer: Gordon Taylor

Reviewer's report:

General

This is an interesting well written paper of an RCT of the effects of functional training on quality of life, vitality and depression of older adults in long-term care. A study of this type has a number of inherent biases such as the inability to blind recipients and the difficulties related to unmotivated patients withdrawing from the study.

I am happy that the authors have conducted the study and the analysis to reduce the effect of any possible bias. I am therefore happy to suggest that this paper is accepted for publication without revision (and it may even be the first time I have ever done this! Certain can't remember the last).

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept without revision

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

None